The Toronto Addis Ababa Academic Collaboration

A MODEL INTERNATIONAL PARTNERSHIP

Speakers: Dr. Brian Hodges, Dr. Clare Pain (University of Toronto)
Moderator: Dr. Keith Martin (CUGH)

TAAAC Program Coordinator: Marci Rose
Quality and Effectiveness in International Partnerships

- In Health Professions Education
- High Income-Low Income partnerships
- Legacy of Colonialism, Risks

TAAAC: latest chapter of very old partnership
The first Canadian-Ethiopian educational partnership

• 1945 Matte helped to reorganize Ethiopia’s primary & secondary schools

• 1954 founded University College of Addis Ababa

• 1961 became president of the new Haile Selassie University

At Haile Selassie University in 1961
A gift between friends

Haile Selassie donated $10,000 to Canada! University of Sudbury
What Does Quality Mean In An International Partnership?

Two Discourses
The economist discourse:
- concerned with efficiency and effectiveness
- achievement of learning outcomes at reasonable cost
- Focused on economic outputs of education

The humanist/progressive discourse
- characterized by a broad concern for human development or social change
After Edward Deming

“Father of quality movement”

"Costs go down and productivity goes up as improvement of quality is accomplished by better management of design, engineering, testing and by improvement of processes”
There is a relationship between economic advancement & education

**Poorer countries, richer returns**

Average increase in earnings for every additional year of tertiary education
1970-2013, %

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>22</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>World</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East/North Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe/Central Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: World Bank

The Economist
But... education is not a factory
The progressive/humanist discourse

- Quality education enables people to develop all of their attributes and skills to achieve their potential as human beings and members of society.
- Quality education provides the foundation for equity in society.
What matters in schools is teachers.

Economist
Jun 11th 2016
Effective teaching is the single most important factor contributing to student achievement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect in additional months’ progress</th>
<th>Relative costliness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feedback to pupils</td>
<td>9 $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meta-cognitive strategies*</td>
<td>8 $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer tutoring</td>
<td>6 $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborative group learning</td>
<td>5 $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reducing class size to &lt;20</td>
<td>3 $ $ $ $ $ $</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education Endowment Foundation 2016
Building Sustainable Quality Education In Sub-Saharan Africa Partnership

(High Income – Low Income Country)
THE CONCEPT OF QUALITY IN EDUCATION

Barrett, Chawla-Duggan, Lowe, Nikel, Ukpo
Universities of Bristol & Bath UK; University of Cape Coast, Ghana; University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania; The Kigali Institute of Education, Rwanda; University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. 2006
The Colonial Legacy
My quality or yours?

Guthrie (1980)
‘Westernization disguised as “better” teaching’
“Something more…”

Hawes & Stephens (1990)
‘Questions of quality’

❖ Three strands:
  • Efficiency in meeting set goals
  • Relevance to human & environmental needs & conditions
  • “Something more” in relation to the pursuit of excellence and human betterment
Quality education must include theory and practice based on African history and culture

Nsamenang & Tchombe (2011)
QUALITY IN HEALTH PROFESSIONS EDUCATION
Health professionals for a new century: transforming education to strengthen health systems in an interdependent world

Julio Frenk*, Lincoln Chen*, Zulfiqar A Bhutta, Jordan Cohen, Nigel Crisp, Timothy Evans, Harvey Fineberg, Patricia Garcia, Yang Ke, Patrick Kelley, Barry Kistnasamy, Afaf Meleis, David Naylor, Ariel Pablos-Mendez, Srinath Reddy, Susan Scrimshaw, Jaime Sepulveda, David Serwadda, Huda Zurayk
Misdistribution of medical schools

Number of medical schools per 10 million population

- ≤2.0
- 2.1-6.0
- >6.0

Education of Health Professionals for the 21st Century: A Global Independent Commission
Quality is based on social need
Requiring systems-based education

1900

Instructional

Institutional

Science based

Scientific curriculum

University based

Problem based

Problem-based learning

Academic centres

Systems based

Competency driven: local–global

Health-education systems
Graduates who are change agents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>Information, skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formative</td>
<td>Socialisation, values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformative</td>
<td>Leadership attributes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 3: Levels of learning*
Summary: Quality Education in Health Care Education is…

- Driven by societal needs
- Inclusive of history and culture
- Supportive of individual & collective development
- Inclusive of equality
- Focused on creating leaders/change agents
- Emphasizes development of teachers
Building Sustainable Partnerships
To Enhance Quality: 3 Risks
‘Importing’ students for training?

Risks 1: Brain Drain
Exporting Curricula, exams, accreditation

Risk 2: Cultural Homogenization
Exporting teachers?

Risk 3: Lack of understanding or respect for traditional culture
The challenge is to create international partnerships that advance quality in education without increasing these risks
• Created in 2003 to build sustainable postgraduate programs
• Today 24 collaborative programs: on site, longitudinal model
• 100+ trips per year, model is one month teaching trips
• Goals are capacity building and sustainability
TAAAC Principles

Curriculum is overseen and owned by Ethiopians

Academic credit/authorship is shared for all work
Miriam Shuchman, Dawit Wondimagegn, Clare Pain & Atalay Alem, Partnering with local scientists should be mandatory, 2014; 20(1) Nature Medicine

University of Toronto faculty are “Invited Guests”

Reflexivity about the purposes and effects (positive & unintended)
Co-Creating a Psychiatric Resident Program with Ethiopians, for Ethiopians, in Ethiopia: The Toronto Addis Ababa Psychiatry Project (TAAPP)

Atalay Alem, M.D., Ph.D., Clare Pain, M.D., F.R.C.P.C.
Mesfin Araya, M.D., Ph.D., Brian D. Hodges, M.D., Ph.D., F.R.C.P.C.
TAAPP: Ethiopia’s First Psychiatry Residency 2003
The First TAAPP Psychiatry Graduating Class 2006
24 TAAAC Programs

- Family Medicine
- Libraries
- Medical Imaging
- Pharmacy
- Surgery
And in 2015 a Masters of Health Professions Education
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Toronto Lead(s)</th>
<th>Ethiopian Lead(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fellowship in Critical Care</td>
<td>Drs. Neil Adhikari and Alberto Goffi</td>
<td>Dr Rahel Argaw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Family and Community Medicine</td>
<td>Drs. Abbas Ghavam-Rassoul and Praseedha Janakiram</td>
<td>Dr. Meseret Zerihun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Medical Imaging</td>
<td>Drs. Korosh Khalili and Josée Sarrazin</td>
<td>Dr. Tesfaye Solomon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Medicine</td>
<td>Dr. Gena Piliotis</td>
<td>Dr. Addisu Melkie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division of Emergency Medicine</td>
<td>Drs. James Maskalyk and Megan Landes</td>
<td>Dr Hiwot Engida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Paediatrics</td>
<td>Drs. Dennis Scolnik and Anna Banerj, Pediatric ophthalmology, Pediatric Nephrology</td>
<td>Dr Sadik Taju Sherief, Dr. Mikael Amdemariam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Psychiatry</td>
<td>Dr. Clare Pain, Psychiatry residency, Drs. Reena Kronitz and Laurie Gillies, Masters in Psychology</td>
<td>Dr. Benyam Worku, Dr. Matloob Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Occupational Science &amp; Occupational Therapy</td>
<td>Marci Rose</td>
<td>Dr. Dawit Wondimagegn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Toronto Lead(s)</td>
<td>Ethiopian Lead(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Surgery</td>
<td>Dr. Michael Ko&lt;br&gt;VATS&lt;br&gt;Cardiac surgery fellowship</td>
<td>Drs. Ephraim Teffera and Ayalew Tizazu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Radiation Oncology</td>
<td>Dr. Rebecca Wong</td>
<td>Dr. Aynalem Abreha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leslie Dan Faculty of Pharmacy</td>
<td>Dr. Heather Boon</td>
<td>Dr. Effraim Engidawork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty of Dentistry</td>
<td>Dr. Joel Rosenbloom</td>
<td>Dr. Wondwossen Fantaye</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering</td>
<td>Prof. Tony Sinclair</td>
<td>Dr. Daniel T. Redda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Sciences</td>
<td>Sandra Kendall</td>
<td>Ato Mesfin Gezahegen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters of Science in Health Sciences Education</td>
<td>Drs. Brian Hodges and Cynthia Whitehead</td>
<td>Dr. Yonas Bahiretibeb and Professor Amha Mekasha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate Speech Language Pathology: School of Education Special Needs Program</td>
<td>Marci Rose and Kim Bradley</td>
<td>Dr. Mekonon Eshete</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**New programs:**
- Clinical epidemiology, Masters in Law, Business: Fine arts, Music and Theatre, Nutrition and dietary
Since 2009, TAAAC has produced 64 publications spanning nearly 20 journal fields and cited almost 1000 times by other papers.

Top co-authorship areas:

- Psychiatry
- Education
- Emergency Medicine
- Medicine General Internal
- Public Environmental Occupational Health
Celebrating a 15 year chapter in a 60 year friendship

UofT President Meric Gertler, AAU Vice Provost Dawit Wendimagegn
A Renewed Commitment 2018-2023
Der biaber anbessa yaser
(Together, a spider’s web will tie a lion)
Amasaganallahu Questions?